
MUNICIPALITY OF CARLISLE COUNCIL MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING OF COUNCIL
DECEMBER 7, 2021 – 7:00 P.M.
760 CENTRAL AVENUE, CARLISLE, OHIO

Mayor Randy Winkler called the Carlisle, Ohio Municipal Council Regular Meeting of Tuesday, December 7, 2021 to order in Council Chambers at the Carlisle Town Hall building, 760 Central Avenue, Carlisle, Ohio. The meeting opened at 7:00 p.m. with the Pledge of Allegiance.

Roll Call:

Mrs. Debbie Kemper	present
Mr. Randal Jewett	present
Mr. William Bicknell	present
Mrs. Kim Bilbrey	present
Mr. Chris Stivers	present
Mr. Tim Humphries	present
Mayor Randy Winkler	present

Staff members present: City Manager Julie Duffy
 Finance Director Ryan Rushing
 Clerk of Council Jennifer Harover

The minutes of November 23, 2021 were presented to Council for review. Mrs. Bilbrey made a motion to approve the minutes as presented, seconded by Mrs. Kemper.

Roll Call:

Mr. Bilbrey	yes
Mr. Jewett	yes
Mrs. Kemper	yes
Mr. Stivers	yes
Mr. Humphries	yes
Mr. Bicknell	abstain
Mayor Winkler	yes

Minutes of November 23, 2021 were approved.

Public Forum:

Mr. Billy Orsborne of 517 Robert Simmons Drive, Carlisle approached Council. He first requested that Council take a moment of silence in observance of Pearl Harbor Day. After a moment of silence, Mr. Orsborne stated that he was here this evening to address the 1% forgiveness of the income tax legislation. He believes that taxes are very near and dear to everyone's heart as everyone likes to keep their money. He also likes to have services in the community where he lives and he understands that it takes money to do that. He also understands that there are several ways of getting taxes. There could be a .5 or .25% property tax to fund some of the areas that Council deems necessary. He is not familiar with the budget or what the current needs are but he feels that dropping 1% onto the citizens makes it an unfair tax. He currently pays 2% to Middletown and, if this legislation passes, he would be

paying 3% income taxes to cities when someone who works in Carlisle will only pay 1.5%. He will pay double of what they would be paying and that does not seem fair to him. Carlisle is and always has been a bedroom community and that is why so many people want to live here. He knows that it is tough to get taxes within a bedroom community but he also knows that you cannot always fund things without having the community's input. He realizes that each member of Council is an elected official and people have put it in their hands to make decisions but making decisions about his taxes should be his own. If Council needed money for city services, he would rather Council come to him with a tax voting situation and let the people decide. If people agree then they will vote for it. Everyone wants police services and fire services as well as all of the other fine services that are provided here but let the people vote on it. No offense, but he feels as if this issue is being jammed down the people's throats without any input. There are other ways of getting funds such as through grants or other things and he is wondering if any of those have been explored by Council. He thanked Council for their time.

Mr. Jason Faulkner, 418 Deer Path Drive, Carlisle approached Council. He and his wife moved to Carlisle in 2019 and they intend to be here for the long haul. He served on City of Franklin's Council for 12 of the 20 years that he lived in Franklin. He would just like to offer some feedback on this tax issue this evening. He would consider himself above average when it comes to paying attention to local issues and he did not know this was happening until about four days ago. When he was on Franklin Council, they also had considered taking this same action of reducing the income tax from 1.5% to .5%. Staff made a presentation similar to the one he believes they heard from the meeting that he watched. At the time, they had seen Springboro do it, costs were going up, healthcare costs were going up and they were subsidizing their Fire Department \$1 Million per year, subsidizing a municipal court that most cities don't have for over \$1 Million per year, they were subsidizing a Police Department that was approximately \$2.7 Million per year and they were looking for additional revenue sources. This issue was presented to them with a bit larger crowd in attendance when it was discussed. One of the biggest complaints that they heard was that it was taxation without representation. On paper, Franklin staff made the same argument that Carlisle staff is making which was there are folks that live here that consumer services but are not paying for them. He understands that and believes there may be a time when they could expect to pay income tax where we live and where we work but he is not sure they are there yet. Mr. Orsborne hit a lot of the same discussions points so he will not repeat them. He is in a similar situation where he works in the Township and pays his 1.5% directly to Carlisle as well as the 1% school tax so he is already paying 2.5% income tax. His wife, however, is similar to Mr. Orsborne in that she works in the City of Franklin and pays 2% income tax along with the 1% school tax and, if this legislation goes through, she would pay a total of 4%. He believes this Council is aware of the competitive nature of bringing residents and businesses to the city. All residents want amenities such as services, grocery stores, retail establishments, parks, bike ways and all of the fun stuff but it takes rooftops to attract that and it takes businesses to pay for it. He does have some concern about doing it this way and it putting us at a competitive disadvantage. If citizens are paying 4% income tax to live here, other cities are going to be more attractive for people to move to whether it be a business or a home. He believes that most people are willing to give some of their money but they want to know that it is going to be spent wisely. They want to know that all other options have been exhausted that don't cost the citizen money. We are all taken advantage of by the State and Federal levels where we say goodbye to a good chunk of our checks and we have no say in what happens to it. This is the citizen's opportunity in order to do that. If he had known that there was a Finance Meeting that was open to the public, he would have certainly wanted to attend. He is not sure what all was talked about but, as a

resident, he would like to know if they looked at a 2% income tax. That is ultimately what Franklin opted to do. They went out and asked the residents and that gave them the opportunity to get the buy-in from the residents. They told them what they were going to do with it and why they needed it. They asked for their support and they were given it. Franklin, at that time, was fortunate enough to have a department head that was very good at writing grant requests. He would like to know if Carlisle has exhausted that. The primary reason for needing the additional revenue was to offset the police department budget. Has Carlisle looked at a metro police department. Franklin's budget now is probably \$3 million and they have a department that is probably five times the size of Carlisle's. He heard that one of the objectives was to get two police officers around the clock. He doesn't know the answer but, if you were to go ask, there may be a cost effective way to work with Franklin to do that and gain access to their dispatch center that would know the geography of the area. He knows that some of the Franklin police officers live in Carlisle so he sure they would like to patrol their own areas. He would like to know what would happen if Carlisle withdrew from the Township as most city residents don't know why they even vote for Township issues and/or what services are offered. There may be some inside mileage that could be claimed. There also may be an agreement made with the school district to bring in other dollars. He wonders about economic development and he has heard the Finance Director say that it would take a payroll of \$15 million to generate the \$600,000. He understands that but wants to be sure that Council has exhausted all possibilities in order to try and get businesses to come here. As everyone knows, inflation costs are hitting everywhere and everything is going up. He doesn't believe that people have realized yet what it is going to cost to heat their homes this winter. The Duke website is already showing cost of natural gas being doubled from this time last year. Even if residents were sent a letter explaining the estimated taxes on 1%, some of them may still not figure it out until January of 2023. He feels he pays attention to local issues more than most and he didn't know this was happening. It seems as though it didn't come up until after the election cycle and four or five people could vote on this and increase taxes. He feels that there will be plenty of upset residents when they figure this out and will have long memories when they go to the ballot box the next time. He appreciates Council's time and he would rather see Council go after the 2% with voters and/or looking at some of these other options. He thanked Council for their time.

Seeing no further requests to address Council, Mayor Winkler closed the Public Forum.

Council Report:

Mr. Humphries went to the Warren County Fairgrounds last Thursday for Amy Brewer's farewell gathering. Anyone who works within local government knows that it is a very time-consuming job. Mrs. Brewer is retiring with 32 years of service and 20 years of those being Mayor of Lebanon. It was a well-received farewell with a lot of people from around Warren County and the State of Ohio. He wished her well on her next endeavors. He would like to plant a seed to begin discussing an opportunity for the School Board and Carlisle Council to possibly meet during the first quarter of 2022. He would also like to begin the process of Council's retreat for 2022.

Mr. Stivers thanked the citizens who spoke this evening and he hears their concerns. He congratulated the Carlisle High School Jazz Band. Yesterday, at the 45005 Christmas event, they treated the guests to some nice Christmas songs. He thanked Mr. Oliver and the Jazz Band for their performance. On November 28, there was a fire on Michael Drive over my Roscoe Park. It was a joint effort of Carlisle Fire Department, Madison Township, Twin creek, Franklin Township and the Franklin Fire Departments

to put the fire out with no loss of life. He congratulated all of those entities for a job well done. He would like all citizens to know that the First Baptist Church in Franklin will have a live nativity this Saturday, December 11th from 6:00pm – 8:00pm.

Mrs. Bilbrey thanked Mr. Orsborne and Mr. Faulkner for speaking on behalf of the citizens this evening. She appreciates their time and input. She thanked all of the citizens who attended the Tree Lighting ceremony. She believes it was a record crowd. The Community Church would have set-up more tables had they known that so many would turn out. The church did an amazing job with their set-up. She thanked Santa for showing up and for the Fire Department giving him a safe way of travel. She thanked the Fire Department, Police Department, JEMS and staff for being there. She also thanked the Carlisle High School band for performing. Tonight, until 8:00pm, Santa, Mrs. Claus and the Grinch will be at 767 Central Avenue. There are also free food baskets out for the community this evening. She has accepted another board position with the Franklin Food Pantry. She was approached about that and she is taking it so that Carlisle can be heard. She will be able to speak on behalf of Carlisle's needs and if anyone has any food needs, please contact her. She would be happy to help anyone with any type of food assistance or other programs that are available. She did enjoy attending the Republic Women of Warren County's program last evening. She is very proud of the position that Mrs. Debbie Kemper received last evening. She also thanked the Franklin Historical Society for the wonderful tour of homes decorated for Christmas.

Mr. Bicknell thanked everyone for being here this evening. It always warms his heart to hear the pledge by a large crowd. Too many times, it is just Council and Staff in the room so when there is an audience, the pledge is great to hear. He would like to remind citizens that as winter weather develops like it is this evening, please remember to slow down. If possible, please do not park vehicles on the streets as this can cause added issues for snowplows and emergency crews.

Mrs. Kemper thanked the citizens for coming out this evening. She appreciates hearing from them on this issue. She will take into consideration each of their thoughts and recommendations. She was very excited about the amount of residents in attendance for the Tree Lighting Ceremony last week. The Community Church did an awesome job with the goodies and the picture area for Santa. She thanked Staff, the Fire Department and JEMS for getting Santa there. She attended the Franklin/Carlisle Historical Home Holiday Tour. It was so nice to see both areas showing homes decorated for Christmas. She did go into Carlisle's Historical Society and it looks very nice. It has been redone and everything inside is beautiful. She encourages everyone to go in and check it out. She is honored to be on the Warren County Board of Women's Republican Party. She was nominated last evening and she will be working for our county. She will do everything she can to help in any situation. She congratulated Mayor Amy Brewer of Lebanon. Thirty-two years is amazing to be on Council and working for the City of Lebanon. She congratulated Council Members Kim Bilbrey, Tim Humphries, Will Bicknell and Michael Kilpatrick. She has been on Carlisle Council for two years and she has sat next to Randy Jewett and he has done an amazing job for our community. He always has his calculator with figures going as he is looking out for the best for this community. She has enjoyed working beside him.

Mr. Jewett congratulated Mr. Bicknell for the tight race between them.

Mayor's Report:

Mayor Winkler thanked the Carlisle Community Church and everyone in the city that was involved with the Tree Lighting Ceremony and the kids that came down from High School and played. It was a wonderful evening. We couldn't have it last year due to Covid-19 but this year it was a very nice event. He also thanked the citizens that came out tonight to speak. We don't often have citizens attend meetings. Most of the time it is just Council and staff. There are some tough decisions to be made on this issue and Council has talked about it at length. We have exhausted most of the avenues that were questioned this evening. He is in a situation similar to other citizens as he works in Centerville. He will pay Centerville taxes, he pays school taxes and this tax will also affect him as well. He can say the same for all of the other Councilmembers. This decision has not been made lightly and he wishes that they had more businesses in the city where these types of decisions did not need to be made. Unfortunately, this is where we are at this point in time. He doesn't like giving away his money either but he does like the services that our community has to offer. He tells people all the time that Police and Fire/EMS services are all very expensive. It takes a lot of money to train them to get them ready to care for others when they arrive at your home. There is high-dollar equipment that is required. We just became a City which means we are now responsible for State Route 123. The State of Ohio no longer looks at us as little guys, we are now a small city and the maintenance of all of that is upon us. Citizens spoke of rising expenses, those same expenses also go up for us as well. As homeowners and citizens here in Carlisle, Councilmembers will incur those same costs. He understands the concerns but, as mentioned before, they were elected to do their best due diligence for the city. They feel that with the situation they are in with the TIFs and so forth, this is the best situation for us to look at for this point in time.

Manager's Report:

Mrs. Duffy explained that Holiday schedule for Town Hall. Employees have specific holidays given to them each year. When those holidays fall on a weekend, our closed days do get modified to allow our employees time with their families. Town Hall administrative offices will be closed on December 23rd and 24th for the Christmas Eve and Christmas holidays. New Year's Day will be observed on December 31st. That information will be posted on our website as well as social media. Emergency services never get a day off or a Holiday so please do not hesitate if you need those services. Life-threatening emergencies can call 9*1*1 and any non-urgent issue can be directed to Warren County Dispatch at (937) 425-2525. She was just notified by our Police Chief and Service Director that crews are currently out spreading salt in some slick areas of the city. Roads do get slick quickly this time of year so please be cautious in curves and on overpasses or bridges. She would also like to irritate what Mr. Bicknell said about parking cars on the streets in bad weather. Please help the City to help you by parking those vehicles when possible in a driveway. This will help with clearing streets of snow and ice as well as helps other vehicles maneuver during bad road conditions.

Committee Report:

None

Old Business:

None

New Business:

None

First Reading of Ordinances and Resolutions:

RES. 14-21 A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO SELL 4.288 PLUS OR MINUS ACREAGE OF LAND IN THE CARLISLE BUSINESS PARK, AND IS ON AS A SINGLE READING.

Mrs. Duffy explained that this item is one that Council has been looking at for a while. Tonight’s legislation would put this discussion into action. The land being discussed is 4.288 plus or minus acres in the business park. She showed a visual of the lot with both a plat and aerial depiction. It is the northern section of the business park. It is across State Route 123 from the Dairy Queen and across Business Park from the current doctor’s office. The land will be sold to Joint Emergency Medical Services (“JEMS”) as a relocation site for the current facility in Franklin. This move is due to the expansion of the Franklin Local Schools and the proposed roundabout in that area which will impact their services requiring them to find a new home. We are happy that they have chosen to be on this side of the river to be able to support Franklin Township needs as well as Carlisle. They believe this lot will serve their needs for the foreseeable future. This legislation will allow Mrs. Duffy to sign paperwork on Council’s behalf to sell the property. The posted sale price for this acreage is listed at \$125,000. This will allow Carlisle to enter into a formal contract and work with the Law Director for the city as well as the attorney on behalf of JEMS. The City is also served by APEX which is a commercial realtor who constructed the contract which has been reviewed by JEMS as well as our Law Director. This legislation is on a single reading as it is important to JEMS to know where the new home will be located as quickly as possible so they can move forward with a concept plan and design.

Mr. Stivers made a motion to suspend the rules requiring three readings, and have one reading by title only, seconded by Mrs. Bilbrey.

Roll Call:

Mr. Humphries	yes
Mrs. Kemper	yes
Mr. Bicknell	yes
Mr. Jewett	yes
Mr. Stivers	yes
Mrs. Bilbrey	yes
Mayor Winkler	yes

With no further discussion, Mr. Jewett made a motion to adopt, seconded by Mr. Stivers.

Roll Call:

Mr. Jewett	yes
Mr. Humphries	yes
Mr. Bicknell	abstain
Mr. Stivers	yes
Mrs. Kemper	yes
Mrs. Bilbrey	yes
Mayor Winkler	yes

Resolution passed on this day will be entered into Resolution Record Book as Res. 14-21.

Mr. Jewett commented that he would like the citizens to know why Mr. Bicknell abstained from voting. Mr. Bicknell is currently serving as Chairman for the JEMS Board so it was in his behalf to abstain from this vote on behalf of the City.

Second and Third Readings of Ordinances and Resolutions:

ORD. 27-21 AN ORDINANCE TO MAKE APPROPRIATIONS FOR CURRENT EXPENSES AND OTHER EXPENDITURES FOR THE CITY OF CARLISLE, OHIO DURING THE FISCAL YEAR ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2022 AND IS ON AS AN EMERGENCY.

Mrs. Bilbrey made a motion to suspend the rules requiring three readings, and have one reading by title only and declaring an emergency, seconded by Mr. Stivers.

Roll Call:

Mr. Bicknell	yes
Mr. Stivers	yes
Mr. Jewett	yes
Mrs. Bilbrey	yes
Mr. Humphries	yes
Mrs. Kemper	yes
Mayor Winkler	yes

With no further discussion, Mrs. Bilbrey made a motion to adopt, seconded by Mrs. Kemper.

Roll Call:

Mrs. Bilbrey	yes
Mr. Jewett	yes
Mrs. Kemper	yes
Mr. Bicknell	yes
Mr. Humphries	yes
Mr. Stivers	yes
Mayor Winkler	yes

Ordinance passed on this day will be entered into Ordinance Record Book as Ord. 27-21.

ORD. 28-21 AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHAPTER 881.081 OF THE CARLISLE TAXATION CODE OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES.

Mr. Humphries commented that he has had a thought on the shelf for a while that he has shared over the past three years since he has been re-elected regarding the value of the City's court system. He doesn't know where they are at with the overall highs and lows of what it could save. Would it save us anything if we were to go ahead and utilize Franklin Municipal Court. He does know that in the last several months he has made comments that he would not vote in the affirmative of any new taxation until that was brought to light. For that, he is wanting to prequel his vote this evening.

Mrs. Bilbrey commented that, as a councilmember, she gave her word that she would voice someone's concerns as the others did tonight. This individual was not able to be here this evening due to another commitment and she assured them that she would voice their concern. Whether they agree or disagree, she did give him her word to speak on his behalf. Mr. Matt Bishop reached to her with his concerns about the 1% and basically they were the same concerns as the other citizens that spoke this evening so she will not rehash them individually. She did discuss this issue with him as well as the urgency of the matter and how the general fund was having to transfer \$400,000 into the Police fund. She explained all of this and Mr. Bishop told her that he trusts her judgement. She liked that he respected the decision once they had a clarifying conversation of why this was detrimental for this to happen. It is not to invoke collection more money from people and there will be several people exempt. She asked Mr. Rushing to correct her if she is wrong and asked if he could explain it once again. She would also like for him to show the dollar amount of how much it will be that comes out of their paycheck. She feels this is good for the residents to hear because somehow that was not portrayed in the Carlisle social media page nor from information passed along as rumors were started.

Mr. Rushing explained that this will only affect those who live in Carlisle but work elsewhere and are contributing no local income tax to Carlisle. Anyone currently working in Carlisle, including those that are exempt, on social security, pension, retirement or active duty military will be exempted from this regardless of their residency. If a resident is making \$50,000 a year, if this were to pass, a bi-weekly pay would incur additional local income taxes of \$19.23. These additional income taxes would be receipted 66% into the general fund and 34% into the police fund as restricted by our current local ordinance. In addition, staff began looking in depth into this during the summer. However, in every single finance report given to Council since the first quarter of 2019, he has stated in writing the need to review this and the need for it. As a former council person himself where he resides, he understands the frustrations of what is seemingly not being able to accurately follow local issues but we do in many ways try to communicate with the public. All of our meetings are public and are published on our social media page as well as on our website. Every agenda for every meeting is posted on our website as well as the full meeting minutes. There may be other means to reach out to our public but those means involve money and resources that we try so hard to conserve and so hard to put to good use. He thanks the members of the public for being here this evening to talk about their concerns. As a taxpayer to Carlisle, he understands that no one wants to pay additional taxes. Quite frankly, it is not something that anyone enjoys doing. As we look at our revenue structure and as we walk through all of the avenues with Council, we have identified this to be the best opportunity and the best fit for our needs. There was talk about looking into property tax. As Council is fully aware, the four TIFs (Tax Increment Financing Districts) are on our books until 2035 whether we like them or not. Until such time, the assessed valuation of our community is quite low. Assessed valuation is the factor in which real estate taxes are determined. To put that into perspective, Franklin Township just renewed a 0.25 mil levy that generated almost equal to our 2 mil levy for our fire department. A levy that is eight times the size generated almost dollar for dollar what a levy an eighth of its size also generated. If we were to seek real estate taxes, the amount of milage we would have to seek would be extraordinarily high in order to achieve the amount of revenue to offset the deficit we have in our police fund. It was also mentioned that we need to be competitive to attract residents and businesses. If you are currently a

business here, you are already paying local income tax to Carlisle. This would have no bearing to businesses or those employed within Carlisle. They are already paying their fair share of 1.5% to local city taxes and they would not be affected by this. This would only affect those who live in Carlisle but work and pay municipal taxes elsewhere. As we know with the 2020 Census, Carlisle had a 12% population growth which is one of the highest in Warren County. The available vacant land in Carlisle is primarily already ear-marked residential or is prime real estate for single-family homes. That means our population will continue to increase. We have not had a revenue source that captures additional population growth. Other communities have a substantial commercial base. Franklin, for example, has an assessed valuation of almost \$300 Million while Carlisle's assessed valuation, with the TIFs, is \$90 Million. When you take out the TIFs, that assessed valuation drops to almost \$60 Million. Commercial properties have a higher assessed valuation. You can see by that, when Franklin increased their city income tax, they were able to capture the additional revenue because they have a substantial commercial base as well as a substantial amount of workers working within their municipality to cover that shortfall. We have, as mentioned tonight, been viewed as a "bedroom community". This means that a majority of our residents work outside of our community. If we raise the effective tax rate, it would still only capture a very small portion of taxpayers. By reducing the tax credit, we have a larger sphere to capture the revenue sources that we need. It was also commented this evening that a \$15 Million payroll would generate \$600,000. It would take a \$15 Million payroll to pay for one police officer which would be approximately \$80,000. We do not have a single business withholding account within Carlisle that generates a \$15 Million payroll. In order to generate the amount of revenue to fill a half-million dollar deficit, we would have to duplicate our largest employer many times over; and, quite frankly, there is not enough land (even if every single lot was developed) to generate the amount of payroll it would need to offset that deficit. It is in Council's purview to make this decision and it is clearly the concerns of your residents that need to be paramount. It is staff's responsibility to give you as much information as we can. He likes to believe, that in his time as Finance Director, he has provided as much information as possible so Council can make wise decisions. Any time he is asked a question, he tries to provide information as quickly and promptly as possible so that Council can make the decisions that are in their right to make. Local income tax is a home-rule issue. It is the authority of Council to determine tax credit. The State of Ohio has it set-up that way and we all live with a set of rules that, whether or not we agree with them, we must abide by them. It is in Council's purview to do that with this issue. He cannot only speak on behalf of himself but he believes for all of staff. We will continue to provide the best municipal services with the resources provided by residents and provided by Council and we will continue to always do that. We believe this is a necessity but if it is not approved this evening, we will continue to provide a level of service that we are able to afford to make sure that we do not incur a negative fund balance. He is happy to answer any further questions.

Mr. Stivers asked, if this issue does pass tonight, when would the tax take affect? Mr. Rushing commented that this is for the 2022 tax year. Tax returns for the 2022 tax year will be filled in April of 2023. We would encourage residents as much as possible, through education, mailings and social media, to have curtesy withholdings from their employer so that when they do file their tax return they would not have to realize the full burden of that tax liability.

Mrs. Bilbrey asked for Mr. Rushing to also explain one more thing to residents. She knows that during their Finance Committee meetings that it was very advantageous for her to see chart of other communities and what they are currently doing with income tax. She understands that Carlisle is one of the last ones standing and she would like for him to share that with the residents now. Seeing what other communities and residents do around us helps to keep it in perspective. Mr. Rushing stated that there are a total of 12 municipalities within Warren County and not all of them are entirely within the county. Some, like us, have portions of their communities outside of Warren County. However, of the 12 municipalities in Warren County, six of them either offer reduced income tax credit or no income tax

credit at all. We are one of the other six that offers 100% tax credit. Of these six, if you take out the municipalities with higher tax rates than Carlisle, we are one of the few remaining. He showed the chart of all municipalities within Warren County and their current tax rates and whether or not they offer any type of tax credit. Of those 12, six offer full credit, five offer partial credit and one offers no credit. Mrs. Bilbrey explained that based on our size, which stood out to her, we are one of the few that are left standing offering any type of credit. Mr. Rushing also showed a chart showing the property assessed valuation of these same municipalities. Carlisle is the second to last at \$90 Million and Franklin is \$244 Million with Mason being the largest at \$1.3 Billion. This chart also showed population and square milage of each as well as the assessed valuation. This chart is important as it is essentially the total available resources of each and every real estate parcel within Warren County. It is also important to note that Carlisle only has one voted in real estate levy which is for our volunteer fire department. It is a 2 mil levy that brings in \$150,000 annually which is very low. If we were to try to capture \$.5 Million, we would have to seek a very high millage levy that, in the grand scheme of things, is unheard of to get into double digit millage. Mrs. Bilbrey thanked Mr. Rushing for his thoroughness.

Mr. Jewett had a written statement that he read.

"As I have been thinking and considering the proposed 1% reversal of income tax forgiveness, I have several concerns. The driving reason for this change is the forecast of the general fund going into the red within a few years. This is largely due to having to cover the balance that the current Police Levy come up short on. The current .5% police fund income tax levy was passed in 1995. A lot has changed in 26 years. The Police Fund has averaged around \$420,000 short over the last few years. Something has to change to avoid having the general fund be in the red. With that being said, I feel there are several things that need to be considered and looked at more in depth before voting to end 1% of the current 1.5% income tax forgiveness. First and foremost, the change of 1% would generate between \$675,000 and \$700,000. This is significantly more than what we are short per year and I feel it is not necessary to add that additional tax on residents. At the most, I would propose a .5% non-forgiveness which would generate around \$350,000 and then see what other areas of the budget could be adjusted to gain the other \$70,000. Even at .625% it would generate around \$430,000. In addition to a lower rate forgiveness, I would also propose making a cut in sewer rates and freeze on water rates to offset any tax increase to residents. We currently have \$2,370,000 in Sewer Fund and \$596,000 in Water Fund. Our sewer system is relatively young so I feel the sewer rates could be lowered and the water rates frozen until there is a need coming on the horizon that would require those rates to be increased. Another option, and the better of the two in my opinion, would be to put a police levy on the ballot and then use the social media platforms available these days to educate the citizens on the deficit that the current outdated police levy generates. This would accomplish two things. First, the money coming in from a new Police Levy could only be used for Police Services. This would let the residents know that no money generated by this levy would be able to be used for anything but Police Services. This means no mowers, maintenance equipment, upgrades at city hall, improvements at our parks, activities at our parks, fire equipment, salt trucks, street lights, staplers, light bulbs, etc. would be allowed to be purchased with this money. Only Police related services. This would include the roll out replacement plan for cruisers, officer pay and benefits, officer safety equipment, training, additional officers, etc. Secondly, this would let the residents have a vote in which avenue they want to fund THEIR Police Department. After all, we are merely 7 voices representing all 5,000 plus residents. If the residents would vote against a new policy levy, then that vote would force council to approve some level of non-forgiveness to continue to keep our police services at a high level. At that time, no one could accuse the council of not letting their voice be heard and having the opportunity to fund it another way. Not funding our police department, in my opinion and hopefully that if this council and our residents, is not an option. Our officers put their lives on the line for each of us every day when they report to work. My recommendation as I am leaving my seat on council, is to table this vote and go back to work on determining the best way to fund our police department. I challenge each of you that

remain and Mr. Kilpatrick as he beings his term as councilmember to go about this process with determination to find everyway possible to keep the financial impact on our residents as minimal as possible. This a great community and I have been honored to serve our citizens in this capacity the last eight years.”

Mayor Winkler asked Mr. Jewett if this was a motion he would like to make.

Mr. Jewett made a motion to table this legislation; seconded by Mr. Stivers.

Roll Call:

Mr. Jewett yes

Mr. Bilbrey commented that she truly does not know what to do in this situation. There was Covid money that came in and that is no secret. She and Mr. Rushing have had previous conversations on ways to be able to give that money back to businesses and residents. This has always been one of her concerns and she has voiced it several times. Whether it be skipping a utility payment for each resident or in some way be able to give that amount back to the community. This is why she is at a hard question about this. She believes in our services for fire, EMT and police and she does feel they need the best of the best. These individuals put their life on the line every single day for people who do not appreciate it. They are expected to be there. There are so many cities that are in trouble because they have defunded their police but yet still want and expect the help to be there. She is a firm believer in the police department. Like many others have said, they support them too but they are torn because it is not an easy decision for anyone. She appreciates Mr. Jewett’s heartfelt comments but she feels there is a way that we can all compromise from both sides. She would like to be able to give credit from the Covid money if this passes. Council just had to transfer \$412,000 into the police fund because of it being short and in 2023 or 2024, they will be down to the 20% reserve where there will be no money to continue to fund them. That is why there is an urgency to make this happen. She doesn’t want anyone to think that “she just wants to do it” but she also believes there is value of doing it. Also, on the back side, giving back to the community with the Covid money.

Mrs. Bilbrey no

Mrs. Kemper totally understands that everyone lives on a budget. She and her husband both work outside of Carlisle so this would definitely affect her. However, she lives in a community where she feels safe. She appreciates the police department and the fire department. She wants to be able to walk outside in the middle of the night and feel safe. She understands the money but she feels that our Finance Director, Mr. Rushing, has done an amazing job trying to find different situations to solve the problem for our police department as well as the Finance Committee. This is a very hard decision for the community but we all want to do what is best for the safety of everyone. She appreciates Mr. Jewett’s letter and his thoughts.

Mrs. Kemper yes

Mr. Bicknell appreciates Mr. Jewett’s words. Everyone who sits on this Council are elected by the residents of this community to make the most important decisions, not half-hazardously, but with the expert knowledge of the staff and board members. Mr. Rushing does an excellent job with our finances and he is lucky enough to chair the Finance Committee. He can say with 100% certainty that there were no stones left unturned, there no avenues not looked at and Mr. Rushing has voiced this to us over many months. As a Council, they have tried their best to not look at a situation with increasing any type of money for anyone. Every house that gets built is another house that our police department needs to monitor for the safety of the people in their home. It is another house that the fire department has to be on call for in case there is a fire. It is another house that needs additional roads to get their

vehicles in and out which are more surfaces that our service department must maintain. Increasing that residential area is a huge burden because costs go up regardless. Just to maintain services over a five year span, the price will be increased each year and that is not increasing any level of service. It affects us all.

Mr. Bicknell no
Mr. Humphries yes

Mr. Stivers commented that every once in a while there is an issue that comes along that makes you walk a fine line between not wanting to make staff's job harder and also doing what is in the best interest of the citizens. He is finishing his second year on Council and he does not want to make Staff's job any harder than it already is. Staff is exceptional at what they do and he has not doubt that Council has been given nothing but good information. With that said, he has to believe that there is another option out there that Council can look at to help fund our police department. He believes that tabling this issue now is the best so that Council can look at other options.

Mr. Stivers yes

Mayor Winkler explained that Council and Staff has worked long and hard looking at a lot of options. He agrees with Council and the citizens that no one wants to pay more taxes. He does not want to do that either. We also have to look at what is best for our community and how can Council continue with the services provided. We are a small city and a large village and our business base is not what we would like it to be. We have gone many, many years without asking for more money. Another of his concerns is that this is not about increasing the police department, it is about staying status quo. The cost of the equipment and the cost of day-to-day business is continuing to go up. He has concerns about police employee's safety being alone given some of the calls that they are required to answer. We often have to call for mutual aid from other communities to back them up.

Mayor Winkler no

The majority of this vote was to table the legislation. Council will continue to look at this issue.

Mayor Winkler commented that, at this time, Ordinance 28-21 to amend Chapter 881.081 of the Carlisle Taxation Code has been tabled for further discussion.

Mr. Jewett commented that nowhere in his statement did he say that he is against a tax to pay for police services. It is more the avenue for which it was going is where his concerns are about. As the citizens spoke of tonight, it not about the services, it is about how to fund them.

Mayor Winkler stated that he understands that.

With no further business, Mrs. Bilbrey made a motion to adjourn, seconded by Mrs. Kemper.

Roll Call:

Mr. Bicknell yes
Mrs. Bilbrey yes
Mr. Jewett yes
Mr. Stivers yes
Mr. Humphries yes
Mrs. Kemper yes
Mayor Winkler yes

Meeting adjourned at 8:07 p.m.

Date: 12-14-21

Randy Winkles
Mayor

Attest: [Signature]
Clerk of Council